Meeting Overview

Agenda:

The agenda for the session is as follows:

1:30 PM - 1:35 PM	Welcome
1:35 PM - 1:38 PM	Opening Remarks
1:38 PM - 1:41 PM	Framing Remarks Domestic Policy Council
1:41 PM - 1:45 PM	Framing Remarks OIRA
1:45 PM - 1:55 PM	Overview of the PPCE RFI
1:55 PM - 2:55 PM	Moderated Listening Session
	Segment #1: Experiences
	Segment #2: Content
	Segment #3: Process
2:55 PM - 2:57 PM	Closing Reflections and the Global Open Gov Context
2:57 PM - 3:00 PM	Closing and Thank You

Key Resources:

- U.S Open Government Secretariat email box - opengovernmentsecretariat@gsa.gov
- PPCE RFI - https://www.performance.gov/participation

Welcome:

- Dan York - Director of the U.S. Open Government Secretariat, Office of Government-wide Policy, General Services Administration
  - Opened the session by promoting transparency and accountability to build trust in government.
  - He highlighted the challenges of addressing issues such as misinformation and disinformation and emphasized the importance of open data and collaboration to build more effective and responsive government systems.
  - He also recognized the role of technology in improving government services and engaging citizens but cautioned that technology alone is not enough.
  - Stressed the need to build strong relationships with stakeholders and engage in meaningful dialogue to build trust and foster collaboration. He

set the stage for a broader discussion on how technology, innovation, and public engagement can help build more effective and responsive government systems.

Opening Remarks:

- Robin Carnahan, Administrator General Services Administration
  - Discussed GSA renewed commitment to transparency, accountability, and participation in a fast-changing world.
  - Reported out on GSA's efforts to support the Open Government agenda, including the establishment of the U.S. Open Government Secretariat, releasing of Mid-Term Self-Assessment Report for public comment, and the intent to create an Open Government Federal Advisory Committee.
  - Robin emphasized the need for action to generate results and set the stage for a broader discussion on how technology, innovation, and public engagement can help create a more democratic government.

Framing Remarks Domestic Policy Council:

- Justin Vail, Special Assistant to the President for Democracy and Civic Participation, White House / Domestic Policy Council
  - Discussed coordinating across agencies to coordinate the Biden domestic agenda.
  - Supports spreading democracy across the country and emphasized that President Biden has said democracy can support the challenges of our time.
  - Highlighted the need to create more mechanisms to gather feedback from the American public, especially in underserved communities.
  - Expressed concern about the backsliding of democracy and a decline of trust in government, institutions, and one another. The Biden administration is engaging with communities and the public in a more meaningful way.
  - Emphasized that a lot of work is still ahead.

Framing Remarks OIRA:

- Sam Berger, Associate Administrator, White House / Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
  - Discussed the role of OIRA in managing centralized review of agency regulations.

- ○ Working to get more public participation in the regulatory process and mentioned that they have had listening sessions and written comments from the public to enhance and create meaningful guidance and set up the unified regulatory agenda.
- ○ Wants to take the approach and spread it government-wide. Having a common approach to public participation across the government is key for success.

Overview of the PPCE RFI:

- ● Shaibya Dalal, Federal Equity and Engagement Lead, White House / Office of Management and Budget
  - ○ Discussed developing a Federal Framework to help agencies more broadly and meaningfully engage the public with the work of the government.
  - ○ Mentioned that they are accepting input until May 17, 2024 but will do their best to consider input received after the 17th.
  - ○ PPCE is encouraged in many policy and guidance documents across administrations.
    - ■ The government lacks a common framework and terminology, and there is no consistent framework for PPCE.
    - ■ This effort will enhance PPCE at agencies and build on other policies.
    - ■ Emphasized that feedback is needed on experiences, content to incorporate into the framework, and the collaborative process to develop the framework.
    - ■ PPCE evidence challenge.gov challenge is important to improve how they evaluate the effectiveness of PPCE.

Moderated Listening Session:

- ● Segment #1: Experiences - moderator: Shaibya Dalal (OMB)
  - ○ **Steve Buckley** - Int'l. Assn. for Public Participation (U.S.): Describes the lack of government commitment over time, and how efforts in the past have done a good job of avoiding how to measure itself.
  - ○ **Bitsy Skerry** - Public Citizen: Happy to see comments from previous listening sessions incorporated into policies and guidance. Needs to be civic education on a public-facing level and in schools. Concern about Corporate influence on policymakers and making it clear that the government is listening to the public, not just corporations. Having a voice

from the government is very important. Social media - should model the NPS social media for the rest of the government. Make information available in languages other than English.

- ○ **Justin Magruder** - SAIC: Will this initiative be extended to state and local government which have a strong need for data standards.
- ○ **Mark Forman** - Dynamic Integrated Services Consulting: Was involved in setting up regulations.gov and erulemaking.gov., as information tools, and more work can be done to improve these tools by allowing the public to see what others are saying up / down vote comments
- ○ **Daniel Schuman** - American Governance Institute: Calls like this should be coming from the president, should be a clearly communicated priority from the White House. Have people to help organize communities. Look at where people are trying to communicate for demand signals. People are in constant contact with their members of Congress. Try to break down silos between Congress and agencies to find out what people care about.
- ○ **Arfa Alam** - Partnership for Public Service: Expressed concern about making sure people know about and understand what the government is doing and how the government wants feedback. Government needs to do more targeted outreach at the grassroots level. Instructions should be very easy to understand. Language accessibility is very important.
- ○ **Evan Lewitus** - Program for Public Consultation: Incorporate the use of representative samples to give more people a voice that can't take part in notice and comment periods. Gives the public a lot more confidence that they are being listened to. It could be surveys would help with confidence that the government is listening to the public.
- ○ **Roshan Bliss** - National Coalition for Dialogue and Deliberation: Need to share comments received from the public, it will help the public if they know what others are saying. Look into AI-supported ways people can use digital tools to share their input.
- ○ **Ryan Wold** - U.S. General Services Administration: Scoping feedback and sending it to the appropriate channel so it actually is actionable.
- ● Segment #2: Content - moderator: Jennifer Lewis (OSTP)
  - ○ **Jennifer Boettcher** - Georgetown University: Put a clause in government contracts for research that would require the finished work be made available freely to the citizens.

- ○ **Steve Buckley** - Int'l. Assn. for Public Participation (U.S.): There should be defined metrics that measure what you want more of. Should ask the public via survey what they want and then follow up to let them know how their feedback was used.
- ○ **Mark Forman** - Dynamic Integrated Services Consulting: How do we get more responsive? It's about being responsive to the public. Measure of success that we can quantify as a result of open government initiatives. What about marketing spending and using it to engage with the public? Have communications be a two-way communication instead of one.
- ○ **Michele Friend** - George Washington University: It's important to coordinate goals and objectives. Has a tool that can help.
- ○ **Alexander Howard**: Recommends that the government bring back petitions and has concerns about lack of trust in the government. Government should use social media to encourage the public to participate and where to participate. Should the public know that their feedback matters.
- ○ **Natalie Evan Harris** - Data Foundation: Education and increasing awareness for agencies on the methods and highlighting different ways of engaging with the public. Data Foundation has an engagement toolkit on the different ways of engaging the public. Capacity building and what stakeholder engagement looks like.
- ● Segment #3: Process - moderator: Dan York (U.S. Open Government Secretariat)
  - ○ **Steve Buckley** - Int'l. Assn. for Public Participation (U.S.): Do not repeat the mistakes of the Obama administration, where the government asked for best practices on public administration and then issued the final open government directive without sharing drafts 6 months later. Put out a draft first and have regular sessions.
  - ○ **Michele Friend** - George Washington University: Find innovative ways to engage with underserved communities. She provided an example of a bus in Mexico to help bring news and educate rural communities.
  - ○ **Daniel Schuman** - American Governance Institute: It's useful to have a conversation rather than the government being in listening mode. The public doesn't know if their input is useful or not. Collaboration is a better approach. Build this into the budget, build in tools and personnel to provide support for public participation.

○ **Kathryn Foxhall** - Society of Professional Journalists: Expressed concern about government media policies restricting federal employees from talking with the press that results in a few people controlling the story, and limiting public information.

○ **Alexander Howard** - Thanked the U.S Open Government Secretariat for going back to holding in-person / hybrid events. He would like OMB to take a similar approach. Look at how the public participation playbook was developed in the NAP 1 and 2 and improve it. Partner with local media to get people in underserved communities involved. Digital town halls with the president and high-level officials. Showing people that participation matters.

○ **Keiva Hummel** - The National Coalition for Dialogue & Deliberation (NCDD): Focus groups with disabilities, younger folks, and older folks; not just people who are digitally disconnected. Also integrate with agencies who would use the framework. Is the framework practical for the agencies? Focus groups with organizations that specialize in civic engagement. Can we have a robust public feedback stage? How do we keep the framework active?

○ **Arfa Alam** - Partnership for Public Service: Suggested simplifying the language used in the feedback mechanisms and conducting targeted outreach to grassroots organizations that represent marginalized and underserved populations. She also emphasized the importance of language accessibility and elevating these issues in the press.

○ **Evan Lewitus** - Program for Public Consultation: Recommended incorporating the use of representative samples into public consultation methods to broaden and diversify reach. He suggested conducting surveys in multiple languages, which can be made available through the regulations.gov site to instill confidence that the government is listening to the public as a whole.

○ **Roshan Bliss** - National Coalition for Dialogue and Deliberation (NCDD): Shared concerns about the lack of transparency around how AI is currently being used in the government. He suggested creating a centralized database of AI use cases across agencies, ensuring that AI is used ethically and equitably, and involving key stakeholders in the decision-making process.

Closing Reflections and the Global Open Government Context:

- Jennifer Lewis, Senior Advisor for Open Government, White House / Office of Science and Technology Policy
  - Jennifer Lewis emphasized that openness is the means by which they strengthen democracy and transparency in the U.S. As well as discussed their global efforts on open government and emphasized that Open Government Partnership focuses on partnership and collaboration with the public.
  - **Jennifer Boettcher** - Georgetown University: Expressed that data.gov should be given more funding to accomplish their mission.
  - **Lorelei Kelly** - Georgetown McCourt School: Members of Congress regularly interact with citizens in their states and districts, the executive branch should try to utilize that public feedback and figure out a way to get this across the branches.
  - **Roshan Bliss** - National Coalition for Dialogue and Deliberation (NCDD): For the proposed Open Government Federal Advisory Committee, he suggested that the GSA remove the requirement to include someone else's resume when nominating someone else to sit on the committee. He would like to nominate someone but doesn't have their resume.

Closing and Thank you:

- Dan York - Director of the U.S Open Government Secretariat, Office of Government-wide Policy, General Services Administration
  - Thanked participants again for their ideas and feedback and stressed the importance of ongoing dialogue.
  - He commended OMB for their leadership on the initiative and noted that participants will be invited to provide written comments by May 17th at the following URL: https://www.performance.gov/participation.
  - Mentioned that the 5th U.S Open Government National Action Plan Mid-Term Self-Assessment Report for public comment, and that the U.S. Open Government Secretariat was hosting a Q&A session on the Open Government Federal Advisory Committee on Fri May 10, 2024.

Full Attendee List:

Virtual:

Name	Organization
Arfa Alam	Partnership for Public Service
Aesclinn Donohue	DHS OCIO Customer Experience Directorate
Alexander Howard	N/A
Alexandra Bornkessel	Office of Management and Budget
Alexis Masterson	U.S. General Services Administration
Amy Benson	SAIC
Andree Reuss	National Institutes of Health
Anna Kwok	Workiva
Anne Stanley	U.S. General Services Administration
Anne Meeker	POPVOX Foundation
Annique Garnier	Data Foundation
Armando Garcia	U.S. Social Security Administration
Arthur Brunson	U.S. General Services Administration
Ben Peterson	U.S. General Services Administration
Jennifer Boettcher	Georgetown University
Brook Horowitz	IBLF Global
Caroline Nihill	FedScoop
Claudia Caceres	City of Redlands, CA
Celeste Espinoza	Office of Management and Budget
Cheryl Klein	Office of Management and Budget
Christopher Murrell	Data Foundation
Tom Atlee	Co-Intelligence Institute
Cassandra Janda	Catholic Charities
cynthia lionheart	Virginia Community Colleges
Courtney Anderson	U.S. General Services Administration
Christina Yancey	American Institutes for Research
Dan Dadingus	Polco
Daniel Pullen	SAIC
Daniel York	U.S. General Services Administration
Daniel Schuman	American Governance Institute

Name	Organization
Daniel Hernandez	N/A
Dave B	U.S. Social Security Administration
Denice Ross	White House Office of Science and Technology Policy
Ellen Kuo	Federation of American Societies for Experimental Biology
Elana Safran	Office of Management and Budget
Evan Lewitus	Program for Public Consultation
Elisa Chen	U.S. General Services Administration
Elizabeth Eisenhauer	Westat
Emma Almon	Office of Management and Budget Evidence Team
Bitsy Skerry	Public Citizen
Alexzandra Fogle	National Endowment for the Arts
Gina DeJong	U.S. Department of Justice Office of Information Policy
Ha-Hoa Hamano	National Aeronautics and Space Administration
Delores Kimbrough	Kimbrough Consulting
Janice Luong	Project on Government Oversight
Jay Vincent	Outreach Experts
Jennifer Lewis	White House Office of Science and Technology Policy
Jennifer Cercone	U.S. General Services Administration
Jeff Goldstein	Office of Management and Budget
Jennifer Goode	U.S. Department of Commerce
Joseph Hoereth	University of Illinois Chicago
Jerry Moore	National Institutes of Health
Jed Herrmann	Office of Management and Budget
Julia Cardis	U.S. General Services Administration
Justin Cole	White House Office of Science & Technology Policy
Justin Magruder	SAIC
Justin Vail	White House Domestic Policy Council
Kailynn Cummings	U.S. General Services Administration
Katie O'Toole	Data Foundation
Keiva Hummel	The National Coalition for Dialogue & Deliberation (NCDD)
Kelly Daughtridge	National Institutes of Health
Kelsey Gray	Westat
Kathryn Foxhall	Society of Professional Journalists
Kimber Thomas	Library of Congress

Name	Organization
Kristen Snow	U.S. Office of Personnel Management
Kristen Robinson	Open Contracting Partnership
LaShonda C. Henderson	U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services
Laura Szakmary	U.S. General Services Administration
Linda Greenberg	U.S. Health and Human Services
Lindsay Steel	U.S. Department of Justice Office of Information Policy
Lisa Mavrogianis	U.S Department of Veterans Affairs
Lorelei Kelly	Georgetown McCourt School
Lori Martorana	IdeaScale
Lori Nathanson	Westat
Mark Forman	Dynamic Integrated Services Consulting
Maggie Jackson Marsh	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency OIG
Martha Wilkes	U.S Department of Veterans Affairs
Mary Boone	#N/A
Matt Bracken	FedScoop
Matt Leighninger	Center for Democracy Innovation at the National Civic League
Manda Cravey	Sebastian County, AR
marjan ehsassi	Federation for Innovation in Democracy - North America
Michele Friend	George Washington University
Michelle Savage	XBRL US
Nicole Armos	Simon Fraser University, Morris J. Wosk Centre for Dialogue
Natalie Evans Harris	Data Foundation
Naomi Charalambakis	Federation of American Societies for Experimental Biology
Norma Ramos	University of Illinois Chicago, Institute for Policy and Civic Engagement
Nick Goldstein	U.S. Small Business Administration Office of Advocacy
Owen Ambur	ConnectedCommunity.net
Patrick Bolton	Dynamic Integrated Services Consulting
Paul Strande	Office of Management and Budget Evidence Team
Monica Fitzgerald	N/A
Philip Ashlock	U.S. General Services Administration
Peter Holden	EDM Council
Renata Bartlett	U.S. General Services Administration
Rilee Bennett	Virginia Department of Health
Ryan Mulvey	Americans for Prosperity Foundation

Name	Organization
Robin Carnahan	U.S. General Services Administration
Roshan Bliss	National Coalition for Dialogue and Deliberation
Ryan Wold	U.S. General Services Administration
Sam Berger	Office of Management
Sara Stefanik	Data Foundation
Sarah Kotler	U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Food and Drug Administration
Stephen Buckley	Int'l. Assn. for Public Participation (U.S.)
Samantha Greenberg	Concepts Communications
Shaibya Dalal	Office of Management and Budget
Sam Theno	University of Illinois Chicago, Institute for Policy and Civic Engagement
Tania Jarosewich	National Aeronautics and Space Administration
Taylor J. Swift	POPVOX Foundation
Thomas Asher	Columbia University, Columbia World Projects,
Timothy Jeffreys	Dynamic Integrated Services Consulting
Dr. Dwight Sanders	Federal Reserve Board
Vanessa Sloane	Office of Management and Budget
Varsha Maheshwari	IBM
Levon Williams	Rooted in Equity
Yvette Gibson	U.S. General Services Administration
Whites House NEOB Room 9047	#N/A
15046169128	#N/A